

EMERGNG ECONOMIES AND THE REVIVAL OF IN PERSON NETWORKING AND MENTORSHIP

Sarina Zainab Shirazi, Maria de Los Angeles Crummett, Sabir Ali

Abstract

As focus of the global management gurus turns to leadership development, it is often experienced that social network theory is pushed to the back in favor of more technical solutions. However, it is the aspect of social network theory in the contexts of personal networking and mentoring i.e. the “soft skills” that takes precedence over the prevailing mechanized systems in place. This study is an attempt to examine the effect of these mechanisms that propagate ideas, information, and influence that flows to the circle of influence, from a mentor to a mentee resulting in a much needed leadership development effort. The scholarship of leadership development in the educational sector of Pakistan provides empirical evidence to support the positive and significant relationship between the in-person social networking (moderated by mentoring) on leadership development of the faculty members at higher education institutes.

Key Words: Social networks, Leadership Development, Mentoring,

I. Introduction:

Leadership development stresses upon the revival of emotion as followers look up to a leader as someone who inspires, raises interest, cultivates a feeling of excitement, stirs enthusiasm and most importantly leads by example (Menges, Kilduff, Kern & Bruch, 2015). The complete cycle of evolution of a future leader would be crippled in the absence of a complete thought process from a mentor to a mentee. Social networking, in this context bridges the initial gap and develops important traits like, leadership emergence, leadership behavior and leadership effectiveness. As

we delve into the leadership development for times to come, focus needs to be on key traits like open communication between leaders and teams, trust, coherence to statutes and appropriate manner of behaving (Jordan and Lindebaum, 2015). There is a need to focus on optimizing leadership capabilities of individuals through networking in order to run organizations successfully.

The concept of leadership development came in to the limelight three decades ago where group interactions were taken as catalysts for the climate change to foster leadership development (Zohar et al., 2008). In order to develop effective future leaders it is important to inculcate a structured patterning of social life as social capital is at the very core of social network analysis (Balkundi and Kilduff, 2006). Leadership development is the process of inculcating various leadership qualities like motivation, communication, management of material and skilled working capital.

The dearth of leadership related research in the context of interactive processes like networking remains largely unexplored. After two decades of the introduction of "emotional contagion" there still remains a need to consider both implicit and explicit effects that may transpire as a result of social networks (Tee, 2015). The subject of social capital was introduced in the early 20th Century as "those tangible substances [that] count for most in the daily lives of people: namely good will, fellowship, sympathy, and social intercourse among the individuals and families who make up a social unit (Hanifan, 1916)". Varying level of integration and social ties significantly contribute to leadership effectiveness. Social networks influence leadership development in a variety of ways. These networks often surface in organizational networks in the form of friendship, work advice, guidance, etc (Liou et al., 2015).

Dearth of leadership has been a major setback experienced by developing countries like Pakistan. The development of leadership in all strata of society is very important especially in the education sector with a majority of the population of a country constituting youth. This study is an endeavor to look at the significance of the relationship between the social networking on leadership development of the faculty members at higher education institutes. Mentoring is taken as a moderator for the study of the leadership development through social networking at the Degree Awarding Institutions (DAI's) in the Capital territory of Pakistan that includes fourteen Higher Education Institutions (i.e. institutions that award graduate and post graduate degrees). The motivation being the fact that social networking is an important antecedent in leadership development.

The methodology used to analyze the collected data includes the calculation of Chronbach's Alpha for testing reliability, Pearson's Correlation and subsequent Regression Analysis as well as the factor analysis in order to identify the latent variables. The analysis points towards the relevance of the independent variable under study towards leadership development in the educational institutions selected for analysis.

In this paper we will: first review the literature regarding the role of networking in leadership studies; second describe the methodology used; thirdly the results and discussions, conclusions and recommended direction for possible future studies

II. Review of Literature:

The research work on social networks dates back to the early 1900s. The social networking although complex and intricate provides valuable insights once untangled. Recognizing the importance of the informal networks within organizations can be traced back to late 1930's

(Roethlisberger and Dickson., 1939). According to Blau and Scott (1962) "It is impossible to understand the nature of formal organization without investigating the networks of informal relations". Social networks are characterized as the flow of information and how the dynamics work between the connected individuals. Tichy et al, (1979) distinguish between the four types of networks namely friendship networks in order to reveal connections based on *friendship*, *influence* networks to reveal power structures, *communication* networks to show who is sharing information and *economic* networks to highlight patterns of exchange of money and goods.

However, critics of social networks and informal structures within an organization highlight the non-structured, unconventional and destabilizing networks in a political economy at large and in an organization in particular (Rogers. 1982). The social networks sometimes tend to revolve around informal ties and may deviate from the organizational objectives (Mansfield, 1985) (Carter, 1989). Informal social interactions can possibly lead to serve the purpose of the selected few and helping those in the network to achieve their private, self-oriented goals and aspirations (Schrader, 1991) as opposed to the organizational objectives.

While Krackhardt & Hanson (1993) use a varied categorization of the networks of a group of designers at a California based computers company where they use (i) "Advice networks" to reveal the prominent players in an organization on whom others depend to solve problems and to provide technical information. (ii) "Trust networks" to reveal the pattern of sharing with regard to delicate political information and support in a crisis. (iii) "Communication networks" reveal the employees who talk to each other on a regular basis

Momentum in this domain built up during the last three decades. The pioneering work being that of Mark Lombardi, an artist who constructed social networks by pouring over news articles in

the 1980s and 1990s from public sources such as news reports and articles. Lombardi made connections between political entities, financial institutions and corporations. Taking a detailed look at Lombardi's work highlights the fact that there are connections in the networks that are not very apparent while reading news articles and news clippings as reported by Michael Kimmelman (2003). Kimmelman mentions his feelings regarding his visit to Lombardi's show and defines his work as very interesting to the security officials of the US homeland security department and he goes on to explain that "Lombardi's work is revelatory not because of the financial and political connections he mapped were new to them but because Lombardi shows them an elegant way to array disparate information and make sense of things". Based on their work it is hypothesized that:

Hypothesis 1: Social networks have a positive impact on leadership development.

Mentoring programs provide an opportunity for the new entrants into any field to learn from experienced people. Mentor-mentee relationships help to foster long term achievement of objectives (Levinson, 1978). Although researchers have examined the advantages and disadvantages that are achieved through the mentor-mentee relationship, a majority of them seem to think that the return to the mentor is quite insignificant compared to the rewarding developmental experience of the mentee (Hunt & Michael, 1983; Kram, 1985).

The benefits to the mentors are a clear indication of the transmission of these positive attributes and qualities to the mentee in the due course of time. People tend to learn from their environments and study the advantages that may occur due to the relationships developed. One may go back to the concept of apprenticeship that existed in many ancient civilizations. The apprentice, a student who learnt skills and social interactions and dealing from their

teachers/mentors are a very good starting point in comparison studies of the modern times mentees.

The leadership literature recognizes that effective leader development is contingent upon the situation (House, 1996). The mentoring literature however, is in its infant stage and is attempting to understand the full benefits to the mentee that come to be realized as a result of this interaction. Researchers are also trying to focus on the type of mentees selected so that efficacy of the whole exercise can be maximized.

The contrasting view may look at the need and importance of mentorship and its effectiveness in a different light. The dynamics can vary as formal or informal mentoring arrangement might become unnecessary in the presence of a structured career development program for the organizational workforce (Dreher & Dougherty, 1997).

On the other hand qualitative studies show that the benefits to mentors range from the achievement of personal satisfaction, fresh energy provided by the interaction with the protégé and enhanced job performance (Newby & Heide, 1992; Allen et al, 1997). Bozionelos (2004) found that the university administrators in England that were actively engaged in mentoring activities got tangible career benefits like increased promotion rates and salary increments. Allen et al. believe that even the informal or voluntary mentors may receive the above mentioned personal benefits as they are seen as "good organizational citizens".

Hypothesis 2: Mentoring has a positive impact on leadership development.

The rationale for future leadership development has evolved and become more complex than ever. In the era of globalization, with complicated job descriptions, the most relevant argument seems to come from main stream media where it is often suggested that we live in times when

we have to prepare the future generations for "jobs that don't exist and requirements we have no idea of". Thus, it is the time to focus on development of talent, team work and dynamic traits in the future generation to equip them to excel in all possible fields that may emerge in the times to come so that they may be able to handle their roles in the future (Willenbrock et al, 2015).

Whether we look at transformational aspect, participative, shared or servant leadership it is clear that we need focus on leadership development aspects of the future generations (Jordan, 2015). The importance of leadership in the context of transformational and transactional leadership is important for all countries but special focus needs to be on the developing countries that are still struggling to be at par with the industrial and scientific giants.

Pakistan with the majority of its population under the age of twenty six years is in dire need of devising a process to channelize the potential of its youth and steer it in the right direction. Social capital is at the heart of the social network analysis and leadership qualities hone the capabilities of the individuals that are going to play a central role in shaping the future of Pakistan in particular and the world in general.

In contrast to this belief there are other studies that suggest the presence of ulterior motivations and the undesirable qualities that develop as a result of the effort for leadership development due to the reliance on individualistic trainings that may result in the deterioration of the formal processes followed in organizations. Some leadership development exercises may even result in the very talked about "awestruck effect" that future leaders may inherit from the system they are trained in. This can result in a number of discrepancies ranging from emotion suppression to the variation in response to factors like trust, integrity, efficacy and the commitment to change, thus altering the future course of events (Menges et al, 2015).

Hypothesis 3: Mentoring has a mediating effect on the relationship developed as a result of social networks on leadership development.

III. METHODOLOGY

In this study the social networks in the higher education institutes and its role in development of leadership qualities in faculty members is reviewed. The research aims to identify the strengths and gap areas that may exist in the leadership development realm of the education sector in Pakistan. The existing study delves in to the prevailing dynamics of the social network and its role in leadership development.

The design of the research is cross sectional field study. One time survey was carried out during the month of January 2017 for collection of data to analyze the model. Primary data was collected from higher education institutes by utilizing a questionnaire with a five point likert scale. The questionnaire is adapted from the study by (Hamstra et.al 2015; Hull, 2015). Data related to social networking, mentoring and leadership development was directly collected from the faculty members. The data collection was facilitated by focal persons that were initially contacted for the survey initiation and facilitation.

Sample of the research was collected from the selected Public and Private sector higher education institutions that are accredited institutions of the HEC. The education institutes included are from Islamabad (the federal capital), Rawalpindi, Lahore, and Wah. The Universities were basically management institutes and engineering universities. The distribution and collection of the questionnaires was facilitated by the head of the departments in various programs of the universities. Initially 200 questionnaires were distributed to the permanent

faculty members with two or more years of experience at these higher education institutes and after close scrutiny it was found that 163 completely filled questionnaires were returned.

The data collected has been analyzed using STATA 14. All the variables under consideration and their responses as per the likert scales have been organized for further analysis. The data was analyzed using the following statistical techniques and procedures:

1. Descriptive statistics
2. Reliability of each variable examined by Chronbach's Alpha
3. Correlation examining the Pearson's Correlation Matrix
4. Regression Analysis
5. Confirmatory Factor Analysis has been employed to identify the factors of the latent variables

IV. Results & Discussions:

The Chronbach's Alpha for the study is 0.72. Nunally and Bernstein (1994) suggested that the minimal acceptable level for Chronbach's alpha is 0.70, so this value represent strong reliability". The results of individual regression analysis and factor analysis are found to be compatible and meaningful. This points to the reliability of the data collected and gives the internal reliability of the items that form the three constructs of social networking, mentoring and leadership development that are being evaluated by the study. The attained value validates the fact that all items measure the same underlying construct. This further goes to show the relevance of these already tested scales when studying the leadership development of faculty members of the DAI's of the selected institutes of Pakistan. The descriptive results point towards standard deviations below 0.667 that is a good reflection of the data set being evaluated. The results confirm the

earlier studies that show the same positive impact of the antecedents that are considered to fall in the domain of "soft skills" (See for stance (Mehmood et al, 2016; Liou et al., 2015; Hamstra et.al 2015; Sanchez-Neunez, et al., 2015; Oosten 2013).

A review of the Pearson's Correlation Matrix also reinforces significant correlation among variables. The KMO-Bartlett's test for sampling adequacy is also 0.859 with a sample size of 176 that is also found to be significant as desired and the resulting scree plot also shows that the factor loading is seven for the data analyzed the first three factors show up as the most significant and should be considered instrumental for finalizing results and conclusion.

The factor structure considered for this study has three main constructs that are further subdivided in to indicators. Five indicators of social networking are considered while the indicators for mentoring and leadership development are ten and sixteen respectively. The three latent variables their respective indicators and the eventually calculated error terms for each indicator can be used for evaluating the characteristics of the target population.

As discussed previously the coaching/mentoring relationships has a significant moderating impact on the dependent variables. These results have been further verified by the data collected for this case study. The Baron and Kenny Method (1986) validate the results. Good quality emotional connections at the workplace have a positive impact on the mentor as well as the mentee and render a higher sense of purpose (Mehmood et al, 2016). The results also show that the enhancing effect on the level of career satisfaction is much greater than any other aspect. So, we may be able to attribute the human co-operation, encouraging colleagues and an over-all congenial behavior at the work place as a primary factor that makes people involved in the work place feel comfortable and committed to the common cause. Having a sense of belonging

compared to the absence of the human touch can result in scenarios that can be devastating to both the personnel involved as well as the organization. The abundance of eagerness in a particular organization that can be felt may surface in organizational settings due to the presence of co-operative work environments. While in contrast, the lack of conducive working environment can result in the form of absence of the zeal to work and thus results in a mechanical way of working.

V. Conclusion and Recommendations:

This research examines factors that are studied in the context of social networks, mentoring and their subsequent effect on leadership development in Pakistan. The findings point towards the positive and significant impact of social networks on the target variable of leadership development a claim earlier substantiated in the study of educational Institutions of Thailand by Liou et al (2015) and further reinforces by Mehmood et al 2016 in the context of Pakistan's telecom sector. Conclusions drawn while studying the mentoring relationship as a moderator clearly points out that in case of Pakistan's sampled education institutions there is a significant and positive effect of the moderating variable on the target variables. There is in fact improvement in the result quality after the moderator is introduced in the model (Mehmood et al, 2016; Liou et al., 2015; Sanchez-Nunez 2015). This kind of study has a potential for contributing towards methodology as well as literature so it is important that in the evolving regional integration scenario a more detailed analysis of Higher Education Institutions and other sectors be conducted. The next logical step is to include performance indicators in order to take a 360 degree view of the situation to get a clearer picture of the systems under study.

RESULTS & TABLES

DESCRIPTIVES:

Statistics			
	Social Networking	Mentoring	Leadership
N	163	163	163
Mean	3.2221	3.4479	3.6340
Std. Deviation	.66593	.65615	.56059

CORRELATION:

	Social Networking	Mentoring
Mentoring	.549**	
Leadership	.218**	.423**

Model Summary

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate
1	.218 ^a	.048	.042	.54881
2	.424 ^b	.180	.169	.51091

a. Predictors: (Constant), SNW

b. Predictors: (Constant), SNW, Mentoring

ANOVA Table

Model		Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
1	Regression	2.418	1	2.418	8.030	.005 ^b
	Residual	48.491	161	.301		
	Total	50.910	162			
2	Regression	9.144	2	4.572	17.516	.000 ^c
	Residual	41.765	160	.261		
	Total	50.910	162			

a. Dependent Variable: Leadership

b. Predictors: (Constant), SNW

c. Predictors: (Constant), SNW, Mentoring

Coefficients

Model		Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	t	Sig.
		B	Std. Error	Beta		
1	(Constant)	3.043	.213		14.285	.000
	SNW	.183	.065	.218	2.834	.005
	(Constant)	2.409	.234		10.282	.000
2	SNW	-.017	.072	-.021	-.241	.810
	Mentoring	.371	.073	.435	5.076	.000

a. Dependent Variable: Leadership

KMO and Bartlett's Test

Kaiser-Meyer-Olkin Measure of Sampling Adequacy.	.859
Approx. Chi-Square	2243.797
Bartlett's Test of Sphericity	
df	465
Sig.	.000

References:

Balkundi, Prasad, and Martin Kilduff. "The ties that lead: A social network approach to leadership." *The Leadership Quarterly* 17, no. 4 (2006): 419-439.

Blau, Peter Michael, and W. Richard Scott. *Formal organizations: A comparative approach*. Stanford University Press, 1962.

Brungardt, Christie. "The intersection between soft skill development and leadership education." *Journal of Leadership Education* 10, no. 1 (2011): 1-22.

Burbaugh, Bradley James. "The influence of leadership development approaches on social capital: A mixed methods study." (2015).

Carter, Richard I., and David R. Spotanski. "Perceptions of leadership and personal development of selected high school students in Iowa." *Journal of Agricultural Education* 30, no. 4 (1989): 30-34.

Daly, Alan J., ed. *Social network theory and educational change*. Vol. 8. Cambridge, MA: Harvard Education Press, 2010.

Digman, John M. "Personality structure: Emergence of the five-factor model." *Annual review of psychology* 41, no. 1 (1990): 417-440.

Hamstra, Melvyn RW, Nico W. Van Yperen, Barbara Wisse, and Kai Sassenberg. "Transformational-transactional leadership styles and followers' regulatory focus." *Journal of Personnel Psychology* (2011).

Hanifan, Lyda J. "The rural school community center." *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science* 67, no. 1 (1916): 130-138.

Holgado-Tello, F. Pablo, M. Ángel Carrasco-Ortiz, María Victoria del Barrio-Gándara, and Salvador Chacón-Moscoso. "Factor analysis of the Big Five Questionnaire using polychoric correlations in children." *Quality & Quantity* 43, no. 1 (2009): 75-85.

Hoppe, Bruce, and Claire Reinelt. "Social network analysis and the evaluation of leadership networks." *The Leadership Quarterly* 21, no. 4 (2010): 600-619.

Hull, Maraya Summer. "Building leadership through rhythm: a study of village music circles." PhD diss., San Francisco State University, 2015.

Ibarra, Herminia, Robin Ely, and Deborah Kolb. "Women rising: The unseen barriers." *Harvard Business Review* 91, no. 9 (2013): 60-66.

Jordan, Peter J., and Dirk Lindebaum. "A model of within person variation in leadership: Emotion regulation and scripts as predictors of situationally appropriate leadership." *The Leadership Quarterly* 26, no. 4 (2015): 594-605.

Juarrero, A. "Complex dynamical systems theory. The Cognitive Edge." (2012).

King, Elizabeth, and Paul Nesbit. "Collusion with denial: leadership development and its evaluation." *Journal of Management Development* 34, no. 2 (2015): 134-152.

Liou, Yi-Hwa, Alan J. Daly, Chris Brown, and Miguel del Fresno. "Foregrounding the role of relationships in reform: A social network perspective on leadership and change." *International Journal of Educational Management* 29, no. 7 (2015): 819-837.

Mansfield, Edwin. "How rapidly does new industrial technology leak out?." *The journal of industrial economics* (1985): 217-223.

Mehmood, Qaiser, Melvyn RW Hamstra, Samina Nawab, and Tim Vriend. "Authentic leadership and followers' in-role and extra-role performance: The mediating role of followers' learning goal orientation." *Journal of Occupational and Organizational Psychology* 89, no. 4 (2016): 877-883.

Menges, Jochen I., Martin Kilduff, Sarah Kern, and Heike Bruch. "The awestruck effect: Followers suppress emotion expression in response to charismatic but not individually considerate leadership." *The Leadership Quarterly* 26, no. 4 (2015): 626-640.

Navarro, Frederick H. "Patterns of Adapting to Health (PATH) Inventory: Cognitive-Behavior-Adaptive Dynamics." (2015).

Roethlisberger, Fritz J. "Dickson,." *WJ: Management and the Worker, Cambridge, Mass* (1939).

Schrader, Stephan. "Informal technology transfer between firms: Cooperation through information trading." *Research policy* 20, no. 2 (1991): 153-170.

Tee, Eugene YJ. "The emotional link: Leadership and the role of implicit and explicit emotional contagion processes across multiple organizational levels." *The Leadership Quarterly* 26, no. 4 (2015): 654-670.

Tichy, Noel M., Michael L. Tushman, and Charles Fombrun. "Social network analysis for organizations." *Academy of management review* 4, no. 4 (1979): 507-519.

Woolcock, Michael, and Deepa Narayan. "Social capital: Implications for development theory, research, and policy." *The world bank research observer* 15, no. 2 (2000): 225-249.

Zohar, Dov, and Orly Tenne-Gazit. "Transformational leadership and group interaction as climate antecedents: a social network analysis." *Journal of Applied Psychology* 93, no. 4 (2008): 744.